

RESEARCH PAPER

Determination of trace metals in vegetables using ICP-MS

Bashdar Abuzed Sadee

Department of Food Technology, College of Agricultural Engineering Sciences, Salahaddin University-Erbil, Kurdistan Region-Iraq.

ABSTRACT:

The aim of this research was to evaluate the total content of heavy metals in selected and frequently used vegetables. Ten samples of the most common diet vegetables (chard, celery, garden cress, spinach, Egyptian leek, wild mint, spring onion, arum, mallow, sunflower) were collected from the local markets in Erbil, in the Kurdistan region of Iraq. The heavy metals were extracted from vegetable samples by microwave-assisted acid digestion utilizing nitric acid/hydrogen peroxide, followed by inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry (ICP-MS) to determine the concentrations of As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb in the samples. The concentration ranges of heavy metals found for the ten types of edible vegetables investigated are as follows (in µg g⁻¹): As, 0.198-0.436; Cd, <LOD-0.396; Cr, 1.653-11.915; Cu, 3.956-17.782 and Pb, 0.244-1.323. The method was validated for total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb extraction by analysing a certified reference material of GBW10015-spinach. From health point of view estimated daily intake and carcinogenic risks of heavy metals were evaluated. Estimated daily intake values of these heavy metals were found to be lower than the maximum tolerable daily intake. This study also shows that the carcinogenic risk for As, Cd, Cr and Pb exceeded the acceptable level. The results of this work recommend that consumers should be more cautious about levels of heavy metals (especially As, Cd, Cr and Pb) in the analysed vegetable samples in order to make sure the vegetable safety for consumers in Erbil city- the Kurdistan region of Iraq.

KEY WORDS: Heavy metals, edible vegetables, inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry, estimated daily intake, carcinogenic risk.

DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21271/ZJPAS.34.3.9>

ZJPAS (2022) , 34(3);73-83 .

1.INTRODUCTION:

Human body requires a number of minerals that can be obtained from plants for growth and activities, because plants absorb and accumulate minerals from environment which requires for its growth. Metals can be accumulated in plants from the environment (Gajalakshmi et al., 2012). Different minerals are reported, traces of As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb have been detected in plants and food stuffs (Rai et al., 2019). is a species very closely allied to *F. tulipifolia* and *F. armena*. Their The term 'heavy metal' is useful for describing a wide number of elements, which performs as group of toxicants. As a result of industrial activities, producing and accumulation of heavy metals have grown. Number of metals, such as Mn, Cu, Zn, Mo and Ni, are considered to be essential or useful micronutrients for microorganisms.

plants, and animals, however tremendous contents of these metals have a negative consequence may threat environment (Gajalakshmi et al., 2012; Tahar and Keltoum, 2011).

Plants can be polluted by microbial growth or metals caused by several factors including environment, pollution, atmosphere, soil, harvesting and handling. Therefore, it is necessary to determine the concentration of these metallic elements, because consuming high levels of these elements cause toxicity. The World Health Organization urges to ensure the quality of plants and its products using appropriate techniques and applying standard measurements (Dudka and Miller, 1999; Gajalakshmi et al., 2012).

Various physical and chemical properties of soil affect the bioavailability of heavy metals to plant such as pH, organic matter content, redox

* Corresponding Author:

Bashdar Abuzed Sadee

E-mail: bashdar.sadee@su.edu.krd

Article History:

Received: 22/12/2021

Accepted: 27/03/2022

Published: 15/06 /2022

potential, cation exchange capacity (CEC), sulphate, carbonate, hydroxide, texture of soil and clay content, taken up by root (Intawongse and Dean, 2006). In addition, the characteristics of the plant, cultivar, stage of growth, and compartment of the plant, the content may influence the absorption of heavy metals. (Habib et al., 2011; Nan et al., 2002). Transferring metals from sediments to the foodstuffs occurs through absorption of heavy metals by the plants (Gajalakshmi et al., 2012).

Bioaccessibility of metals for plant absorption can be classified into three categories: bioavailable heavy metals including As, Cd, Cu, Ni and Zn, reasonably bioavailable (Mn) or minimum bioavailable (Cr and Pb). The availability of Fe, Cu, Mn, and Zn is quite inferior in alkaline soils but in acid soils the concentration of Al and Mn would increase to poisonous levels and impact adversely on plant progress (White, 2012).

Accumulation of heavy metals through the food chain results in problems with oxidation condition of living cell, peroxidation of lipid, damaging filaments of DNA, protein expression and folding, deterioration in proteasome, protein interchanges, revolution and death of cell (Parris and Adeli, 2002; Khan et al., 2015; Cvjetko et al., 2014). Some diseases including a deterioration in impenetrable defences, delay of preventative development, defective of psycho-social conduct, impairment linked with malnutrition, and a high pervasiveness of elevated gastrointestinal cancer occur because of ingestion of food and vegetation polluted with heavy metals (Deribachew et al., 2015).

The As species can be highly toxic to human and domestic animals (Codex Alimentarius Commission, 2016). As may harm the majority of terrestrial plants (Jedynak et al., 2009). Most plant species can uptake As through the water flow and accumulate in the plants. It was estimated that the edible plant to have the As concentration with a range of 0.01 to 0.06 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, some edible plants are able to tolerance high levels of As with average of 2 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Kabata-Pendias and Mukherjee, 2007; Samantaray et al., 1998).

It is considered that Cd is a toxic industrial pollutant with expressed mobility and widely spread in nature (Valko et al., 2005). It has been reported that high levels of Cd have been found in

the organs of edible plants since Cd becomes a great issue for food security (Grytsyuk et al., 2006). Cr functions as a nutritive improvement to glucose digestion for humans therefore its important for them and for animals as well because it has function in normal digestion of carbohydrates and lipids cancer (Samantaray et al., 1998). Although chromium (III) is classified as an essential element, chromium (VI) is a human carcinogen and leading to increased risk of lung cancers especially bronchogenic and nasal (Wilbur et al, 2012). The plant poisonous levels of Cr in superior part of plants were found to be as follows: 18 to 24 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ in tobacco, 4 to 8 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ in corn and 10 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ in barley seedlings (Kabata-Pendias, 2011).

Although Cu is a crucial element for plant nutrient, it shows toxicity at high concentrations. Cu is involved for constituting enzymes catalyzing redox reactions, and it is necessary in photosynthetic functions (Adrees et al., 2015). The elevated quantity of reactive oxygen species (ROS) is persuaded and the photosystem in photosynthesis will be affected by excess Cu (Schutzendubel and Polle, 2002; Bouazizi et al., 2010; Quartacci et al., 2000), which leads to reduce the yield or quality of crops. The toxic effects of Cu have been investigated in different crops. If the concentration of Cu in soil is more than 300 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ the yields of rice grain will be reduced about 50 % (Xu et al., 2006). At low concentration, Pb and Cd induce toxicity because they are not essential for human, animals and even plants. Pb has been detected in some environmental and biological samples (Guerra et al., 2012).

The purpose of this study was to determine the concentration of heavy metals in some common and different edible vegetable species and estimate its validity and suitability for human beings use according to health risk assessments.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Chemicals and Reagents

Analytical pure chemicals were used in this study. Milli-Q water (18M Ω cm) was used to prepare all solutions. The high purity stock solution 100 $\mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$ in 5 % HNO₃ obtained from CPI international (Peak performance, USA) was used to prepare standard solutions of total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb. Hydrogen peroxide 37% and nitric acid 70% were purchased from Merck. Spinach

GBW10015 certified reference material (CRM) (Institute of Geophysical and Geochemical Exploration, Langfang, China) was supplied by LGC standards (Middlesex, UK).

2.2 Instrumentation

An Agilent 7500 instrument (USA) ICP-MS was used to measure total elements in extracts of vegetable samples. The employed working parameters are shown in Table 1. Possible interferences were eliminated using collision cell technology. Final concentration of 10 µg L⁻¹ Indium (In) and iridium (Ir) was employed as internal standards for all samples. The analyzed masses of As (m/z 75), Cd (m/z 112), Cr (m/z 52), Cu (m/z 65), pb (m/z 208), In (m/z 115) and Ir (m/z 193) were obtained by employing the mass spectrometer to sample ion intensities (peak jumping option).

Table 1 ICP-MS operating parameters applied for the measurement of total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb in digested vegetable samples.

ICP-MS	Agilent 7500 instrument	
	Peristaltic pump speed ml /min	1.0
	Nebulizer type	V-groove
	Spray chamber	Sturman-masters
	Radio frequency power (W)	1350
Gas flows (L min ⁻¹)	Coolant	12.4
	Auxiliary	0.9
	Nebulizer	0.8
H ₂ addition	Gas flow (ml min ⁻¹) 7 % H ₂ in He	3.2
Dwell time (ms)	ICP-MS	10

2.3 Sampling and Sample preparation

A total of ten different vegetable samples were purchased from local markets in Erbil-Kurdistan Region-Iraq in April 2021. Table 2 shows the popular, scientific names and number of analysed samples. All samples were stored in sealed containers at the point of collection. These

were then washed with Milli-Q water. All samples were dried using freeze drier for 48 hrs at -40 °C. All dried samples were ground (using an agate pestle and mortar) and sieved to obtain 180 µm sample size using a nylon nylon180 µm sieve.

Table 2: Popular and scientific names, and the number of analysed vegetable samples

Common name	Scientific name	Total number of analysed samples
Chard	<i>Beta vulgaris subsp.</i>	3
Celery	<i>Apium graveolens</i>	3
Garden cress	<i>Lepidium sativum L.</i>	3
Spinach	<i>Spinacia oleracea</i>	3
Egyptian leek	<i>Allium Kurrat. Schweinf.</i>	3
Wild mint	<i>Mentha longifolia</i>	3
Spring onion	<i>Allium fistulosum</i>	3
Arum	<i>Arum spp</i>	3
Mallow	<i>Malva parviflora</i>	3
Sunflower	<i>Gundelia tournefortii</i>	3

2.4 Determination of total metals in vegetable samples

Acid digestion of vegetable samples was employed by a Mars Xpress microwave lab station (CEM, USA) using 100 mL capacity closed Teflon tubes with Teflon lids. The digestion of vegetable samples was based on Foulkes's et al (2020) publication. 0.25 g of freeze dried vegetable samples was weighed and transferred into separate

pre-cleaned Teflon reaction tubes followed by adding 5 ml HNO₃ (70%) and 2 mL H₂O₂ (30%) were put into each vessel. 1600 W was used for 43 min to conduct total digestion of all vegetable samples. The digestion process was performed as follows: the temperature ramped up to 160 °C for about 15 min and continued at this temperature for another 5 min, then the temperature raised from

160 to 200 °C in 8 min and continued at this temperature for an additional 15 min.

Once the digestion completed, the Teflon reaction tubes were permitted to cool down at room temperature. After the acid digestion was achieved, the samples were placed quantitatively into volumetric flasks (25 mL capacity) and completed to final 25 mL volume with 2% (v/v) HNO₃. In and Ir were added as internal standards to both the vegetable samples and standards (final concentration of 10 µg L⁻¹) for correction instrument drift (owing to sample viscosity effects, mass transport, etc.) throughout the analysis time, using ICP-MS. Total concentration of heavy metals including As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb were validated in analysed vegetable samples using CRM (GBW10015-spinach).

3. Results and discussion

3.1 Results of CRM analyses for total heavy metals

Total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb were determined in GBW10015-spinach for validation of the applied procedures. The analytical validity for, As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb were based on the use of CRM, GBW10015-spinach. This reference material was chosen to depict plant and vegetable samples. Good recoveries were obtained for total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb in the spinach with values of 109 and 96 % of the certified value, respectively. The results for total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and pb concentration in all CRMs are shown in Table 3.

3.2 Total Metals concentration in vegetables

The results of the content of heavy metals in the selected vegetable samples are given in Table 4. The bioaccumulation of heavy metals concentration in all the vegetables of this study are different, however, similar trends have been noticed for heavy metal concentration in seven vegetables of this study. The heavy metal bioaccumulation in chard, garden cress, Egyptian leek, wild mint, arum, mallow and sunflower was Cu > Cr > Pb > As > Cd, for celery was Cu > Cr > Pb > Cd > As, for spinach was Cr > Cu > Pb > As > Cd, for spring onion was Cu > Cr > As > Pb > Cd.

To validate the utilized method, total As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb were measured in the certified reference material GBW10015-spinach which showed satisfied recovery.

Table 3 CRM examination for total metals; all experimental values are given in µg g⁻¹, mean ± standard deviation (n=3)

Metals	Certified value	Experimental value obtained	Extraction efficiency %
Arsenic	0.230 ± 0.03	0.236 ± 0.017	103
Chadmium	0.150 ± 0.025	0.157 ± 0.003	105
Chromium	1.4 ± 0.2	1.45 ± 0.04	104
Copper	8.9 ± 0.4	8.521 ± 0.629	96
Lead	11.1 ± 0.9	12.1 ± 0.678	109

3.2.1 Arsenic

The concentration of As in the investigated vegetable samples varied from 0.160-0.436 µg g⁻¹ (Table 4). The maximum concentration of As was found in spring onion, with a mean content for the triplicate measurements of 0.436 ± 0.007 µg g⁻¹ dry weight (mean ± SD), while the minimum concentration of As (0.160 µg g⁻¹) was detected in the celery. The concentration of As in chard (0.308 µg g⁻¹) was encountered to be higher than the result documented 0.09 µg g⁻¹ by Gezahegn et al. (2017). The concentration of As in celery found in this study was similar to the values (0.154-0.196) obtained by Lin's et al (2014). Garden cress was contained 0.239 µg g⁻¹ As which is lower than the concentration (0.095 µg g⁻¹) reported by Souri et al. (2018). The concentration of As in Egyptian leek (0.294 µg g⁻¹) was higher than the concentration (0.007 to 0.107 µg g⁻¹) obtained by Cheyns et al. (2017). The concentration of total As (0.215 µg g⁻¹) in wild mint was lower than that obtained by Rahman et al. (2007) which was 0.6 µg g⁻¹. The As content found in spinach (0.381 µg g⁻¹) and arum (0.239 µg g⁻¹) were higher than the concentrations, 0.015 µg g⁻¹ and 0.175 µg g⁻¹, obtained by Khan et al. (2010) and Haque et al.(2020), respectively. The level of total As in spring onion (0.436 µg g⁻¹) was lower than the value reported by Mustăţea et al. (2019) which was 3.59 µg g⁻¹. The As contents in Mallow and sunflower were found to be 0.409 µg g⁻¹ and 0.198, respectively.

The maximum limit of As in vegetables has not been recommended yet. The statutory limit set for As concentration in fruit, crops and vegetables

is $1.0 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (fresh weight) (Carbonell-Barrachina et al., 2019). The concentration of As found in the vegetable samples (0.160-0.436) was lower than the mean concentration of As in plants which is $3.6 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Kabata-Pendias, 2000).

Inorganic forms of As are generally categorized to be the most poisonous species to humans (Jain, and Ali, 2000). The inorganic species of As tend to be predominant in plants (Jedynak et al., 2009; Jedynak et al., 2010) including a number of different crops and vegetables (Signes-Pastor et al., 2008; Smith et al., 2009). Therefore, it can be concluded that the majority of As found in the investigated vegetables are inorganic forms which possess toxicological effect on human health.

3.2.2 Cadmium

The cadmium concentration (Cd) ranged from <LOD to $0.396 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Table 4). Cd was below the limit of detection of method ($0.02 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) in wild mint and arum. The maximum concentration of Cd detected in Mallow was $0.396 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Table 4).

The concentrations of Cd in chard ($0.054 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), garden cress ($0.224 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), spinach ($0.182 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), Egyptian leek ($0.059 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), were lower than the concentrations (0.56 to $1.62 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) documented by Mohamed et al. (2003) but higher than the concentration ($0.04 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) reported by Bigdeli and Seilsepour, 2008). The Cd content in celery ($0.329 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) obtained was greater than that documented (0.03 to $0.152 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) by Rusin et al. (2021). The present concentration $0.224 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ of Cd evaluated in garden cress was lower than the value obtained by Bigdeli and Seilsepour (2008) which was $1.25 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. The Cd content in spring onion ($0.037 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was lower than that reported ($0.20 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) by Naghipour et al. (2018). The concentration of Cd measured in Mallow and sunflower were 0.396 and $0.051 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively. According to WHO/FAO the recommended allowable safe limit for Cd in vegetables is $0.3 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Elbagermi et al., 2012). Thus, based on the findings obtained from this study, it could be concluded that the concentration of cadmium in vegetable samples did not exceeded the standard limit except the celery and Mallow samples.

3.2.3 Chromium

The level of Cr varied from 1.653 to $11.915 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. Cr maximum concentration $11.915 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ was recorded in arum and lowest concentration

$1.653 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ was obtained in spring onion as presented in Table 4. The concentrations of Cr in chard ($4.456 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) and celery ($3.811 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) were higher than results documented (0.07 and $0.14 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively) by Guerra et al. (2012). The level of Cr in garden cress ($3.332 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) and wild mint ($5.023 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) were higher than those documented (0.326 and $0.304 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively) by Mahdavi (2009). The concentration of Cr in spinach ($11.075 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was higher than reported ($6.625 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) by Abdul Latif et al. (2018). In Egyptian leek, the Cr content in present study ($2.904 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was in line with Taghipour and Mosaferi (2013), who reported to be $2.81 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. The concentration of estimated Cd in spring onion, Mallow and sunflower were 1.653 , 1.715 and $3.754 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively.

The concentration of Cr in all the vegetables exceeds than the allowed limit $0.1 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ by FAO/WHO (Latif et al., 2018). Thus, the consumers were at risk because of high content of Cr and exceeding the allowable limit.

3.2.4 Copper

The concentrations of Cu ranged between 3.956 and $17.782 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Table 4). The lowest level detected in a sample of garden cress ($3.956 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) and highest concentration was found in arum ($17.782 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$). The concentration of Cu in chard ($8.498 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), spinach ($7.826 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), Egyptian leek ($9.754 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) were higher than that obtained by Mohamed et al. (2003) for the same vegetables which were 1.86 , 2.71 and $1.56 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively. The level of Cu in spring onion was $6.365 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ and higher than the Cu level ($5.44 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) obtained by Naghipour et al. (2018). The concentration of Cu in celery, $9.304 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, was higher than the result of Zokaei et al. (2018) which was $2.91 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. The result for Cu level for garden cress, $3.956 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, was higher than that obtained by Soury et al. (2018) for the same vegetable which was $2.11 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Soury et al., 2018). The results for Cu concentration in wild mint, $7.845 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, was close to the results of Dghaim et al. (2015) which was between 3.82 - $12.32 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. The concentrations of Cu in arum, Mallow, sunflower and were 17.782 , 6.500 and $7.181 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively. However, the Cu content of all the vegetables of this study did not exceed the standard limit of FAO/WHO ($40 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) (Elbagermi et al., 2012).

3.2.5 Lead

The concentration of Pb found in the samples were in the range of 0.244-1.323 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ and all concentrations are calculated on dry weight basis (Table 4). The highest level of Pb (1.323 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was found in celery, and the lowest value was in spring onion with concentration of 0.244 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$

¹. The concentration of Pb in chard (0.563 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) and spinach (0.575 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) were lower than the concentration (46.24 and 10.29 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) reported previously in the study conducted by Mohamed et al. (2003).

Table 4 Total metal concentration in vegetables ($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ dry weight)

Vegetable	As $\mu\text{g g}^{-1} \pm \text{SD}$	Cd $\mu\text{g g}^{-1} \pm \text{SD}$	Cr $\mu\text{g g}^{-1} \pm \text{SD}$	Cu $\mu\text{g g}^{-1} \pm \text{SD}$	Pb $\mu\text{g g}^{-1} \pm \text{SD}$
Chard	0.308 \pm 0.008	0.054 \pm 0.003	4.456 \pm 0.067	8.498 \pm 0.041	0.563 \pm 0.008
Celery	0.160 \pm 0.007	0.329 \pm 0.003	3.811 \pm 0.040	9.304 \pm 0.069	1.323 \pm 0.025
Garden cress	0.239 \pm 0.011	0.224 \pm 0.006	3.332 \pm 0.022	3.956 \pm 0.036	0.466 \pm 0.002
Spinach	0.381 \pm 0.009	0.182 \pm 0.005	11.075 \pm 0.089	7.826 \pm 0.083	0.575 \pm 0.009
Egyptian leek	0.294 \pm 0.009	0.059 \pm 0.005	2.904 \pm 0.028	9.754 \pm 0.046	0.342 \pm 0.006
Wild mint	0.215 \pm 0.008	<LOD ^a	5.023 \pm 0.095	7.845 \pm 0.096	0.425 \pm 0.005
Spring onion	0.436 \pm 0.007	0.037 \pm 0.001	1.653 \pm 0.013	6.365 \pm 0.070	0.244 \pm 0.003
Arum	0.239 \pm 0.011	<LOD ^a	11.915 \pm 0.038	17.782 \pm 0.255	0.272 \pm 0.002
Mallow	0.409 \pm 0.011	0.396 \pm 0.014	1.715 \pm 0.015	6.500 \pm 0.033	0.782 \pm 0.009
Sunflower	0.198 \pm 0.009	0.051 \pm 0.003	3.754 \pm 0.045	7.181 \pm 0.049	0.382 \pm 0.001

^a Concentration of Cd (0.019 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) is below limit of detection of method

The concentration of Pb in Egyptian leek (0.342 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) and spring onion (0.244 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) of this investigation were lower compared to the study performed by Naghipour et al. (2018) which were 1.27 and 0.58 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively, while the concentration of Pb acquired in celery (1.323 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was higher than the result of Guerra et al. (2012) and Rusin et al. (2021) which were 0.47 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ and 0.259, respectively. Regarding garden cress, the concentration of Pb was 0.466 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ and lower than that gained by Souri et al. (2018) which was 3.5 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. Wild mint vegetable had lower concentration of Pb (0.425 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) than that obtained by Dghaim et al. (2015) and Naghipour et al. (2018) which were 1.44 and 1.8 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively.

The concentrations of Pb in arum, Mallow and sunflower were 0.272, 0.782 and 0.382 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively.

The provisional tolerable weekly intake (PTWI) of Pb is 0.025 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ body weight. The maximum level of Pb in leafy vegetables recommended by FAO/WHO is 0.1-0.3 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$ (Codex Alimentarius, 2016). Therefore, based on the findings obtained from this study, it could be concluded that the concentration of lead in all samples exceeded the standard limit except the arum sample.

3.3 Estimated daily intake

The estimated daily intake (EDI) of metals can be used to assess the average daily metals ingestion through consumption of vegetables by a specified bodyweight consumer. The value of EDI was calculated by the following equation (Zakaria et al, 2021):

$$EDI = \frac{C_{\mu\text{g g}^{-1}} \times AV \text{ (kg/day)}}{BM \text{ (Kg)}} \quad (1)$$

Where C is the mean heavy metal content in the vegetable ($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), AV is the vegetable intake consumed per day (kg/day), and BM is the mean body weight of the person (Kg). The WHO recommended to consume 300 to 350 g of vegetables daily per person in their diet. The mean 0.325 kg/person/day was used to calculate EDI.

In this study, a mean weight of person was recorded to be 65 kg (Gebreyohannes and Gebrekidan, 2018). Results of EDI are presented in Table 5.

Table 5 Estimated daily intake (EDI) of metals in adult through the consumption of vegetables.

Vegetable	As	Cd	Cr	Cu	Pb
Chard	0.0015	0.0003	0.0223	0.0425	0.0028
Celery	0.0008	0.0017	0.0191	0.0465	0.0066
Garden cress	0.0012	0.0011	0.0167	0.0198	0.0023
Spinach	0.0019	0.0009	0.0554	0.0391	0.0029
Egyptian leek	0.0015	0.0003	0.0145	0.0488	0.0017
Wild mint	0.0011	0.00	0.0251	0.0392	0.0021
Spring onion	0.0022	0.0002	0.0083	0.0318	0.0012
Arum	0.0012	0.00	0.0596	0.0889	0.0014
Mallow	0.0021	0.0020	0.0086	0.0325	0.0039
Sunflower	0.0010	0.0003	0.0188	0.0359	0.0019
WHO/FAO ^b	0.195 ^b	0.05 ^b	0.2 ^c	3.25-32.5 ^b	0.3 ^b

^b(Codex Alimentarius, 2016)

^c (Sultana et al, 2021)

3.4 Carcinogenic risk of trace metals

The carcinogenic risk of heavy metals from the ingestion pathway of each metals can be calculated as the following formul (Shaheen et al, 2016):

$$TR = (Efr \times ED \times FIR \times C \times SF) / (BW \times AT) \quad (2)$$

Where TR is carcinogenic risk of heavy metal or the risk of lifetime cancer, Efr is exposure frequency (365 days), ED is exposure duration (70 years for adult), FIR represents ingestion rate (0.325 kg), C is metal concentration ($\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), AT represents the averaging time for carcinogens (365 days/year x ED) and BW is body weight (65 Kg).

SF is the oral carcinogenic slope factor is defined as the risk produced by a lifetime mean quantity of single mg/kg/day of carcinogen chemical and is contaminant specific (Mohammadi et al, 2019). The values of SF are 1.5, 6.1, 0.5, 0.0085 (mg/kg/day)⁻¹ for As, Cd, Cr and Pb respectively.

Table 6 Target carcinogenic risk of heavy metals in analysed vegetables

Vegetable	As	Cd	Cr	Pb
Chard	2.30E-03	1.70E-03	1.10E-02	2.40E-05
Celery	1.20E-03	1.00E-02	9.50E-03	5.60E-05

The carcinogenic risk of Cu was not estimated because of the lack of oral carcinogenic slope factor, however, the carcinogenic risks for other four metals (As, Cd, Cr and Pb) were evaluated and presented in Table 6.

The permissible levels of TR are considered to be 1.0E-6 and <1.0E-4 for an individual carcinogenic element and multi-element carcinogens (Živković et al., 2019). In the present work, carcinogenic risk through ingestion for all vegetables of As (1.20E-03 - 3.30E-03), Cr (2.80E-03-3.00E-02), and Pb (1.00E-05- 5.60E-05) were found to be higher than the acceptable range. Despite TRs for most of the vegetables exceeded the acceptable level (1.0E-6), the TR value for wild mint and arum is insignificant and lower than the acceptable value. The results of this work indicate that there is a cancer risk from heavy metals of As, Cd, Cr and Pb through consuming these vegetables.

Garden cress	1.80E-03	6.80E-03	8.30E-03	2.00E-05
Spinach	2.90E-03	5.60E-03	2.80E-03	2.40E-05
Egyptian leek	2.20E-03	1.80E-03	7.30E-03	1.50E-05
Wild mint	1.61E-03	0.00E+00	1.30E-02	1.80E-05
Spring onion	3.30E-03	1.10E-03	4.10E-03	1.00E-05
Arum	1.80E-03	0.00E+00	3.00E-02	1.20E-05
Mallow	3.10E-03	1.20E-02	4.30E-03	3.30E-05
Sunflower	1.50E-03	1.60E-03	9.40E-03	1.60E-05

4. Conclusion

The highest level of total As was found in spring onion with $0.436 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, while lowest level total As was found in celery which was $0.160 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. Cd concentration was found to be below the limits of detection in wild mint and arum samples, however, high concentration of Cd ($0.396 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) was detected in Mallow. The results of this study showed that Cr and Cu were found in high concentrations in the investigated vegetables comparing with other examined heavy metals. In addition, the highest concentrations of both Cr and Cu were found in arum with 11.915 and $17.782 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively. However, the lowest concentration of Cr and Cu were found in the spring onion and garden cress with 1.653 and $3.956 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, respectively. The highest level of Pb was found in a sample of celery with $1.323 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$, whilst lowest Pb concentration was found in spring onion which was $0.244 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$.

The high levels of certain heavy metals in some vegetable was consequence of the growing conditions of these vegetable samples in agricultural soils and irrigated water supply. The estimated daily intake for As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb in vegetables were in the range of 0.008-0.022, 0.002-0.020, 0.0083-0.0554, 0.0198-0.0889 and 0.0012-0.0066, respectively.

The estimated daily intake of As, Cd, Cr, Cu and Pb in vegetables were lower than the maximum tolerable daily intake values recommended by WHO/FAO. From human health prospective, the carcinogenic risk of single metals of $1.20\text{E}-03$ - $3.30\text{E}-03$, Cr ($2.80\text{E}-03$ - $3.00\text{E}-02$), and Pb ($1.00\text{E}-05$ - $5.60\text{E}-05$) were found to be lower than the acceptable level ($1.0\text{E}-06$). This results indicated that there was adverse health and cancer risk from these heavy metals to residents who consumed these vegetables.

Conflict of Interest

The author has declared no conflicts of interest.

References

- Adrees, M., Ali, S., Rizwan, M., Ibrahim, M., Abbas, F., Farid, M., Zia-ur-Rehman, M. Irshad, M., and Bharwana, S. 2015. The effect of excess copper on growth and physiology of important food crops: a review. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 22(11), 8148-8162.
- Barbes, L. Barbulescu, A., Radulescu, C., Stihi, C. and Chelarescu, E. 2014. Determination of heavy metals in leaves and bark of *Populus nigra* L. by atomic absorption spectrometry. *Romanian Reports in Physics* 66(3), 877-886.
- Bigdeli, M. and Seilsepour, M. 2008. Investigation of metals accumulation in some vegetables irrigated with waste water in Shahre Rey-Iran and toxicological implications. *Am Eurasian J Agric Environ Sci* 4(1), 86-92.
- Bouazizi, H., Jouili, H., Geitmann, A. and El Ferjani, E. 2010. Copper toxicity in expanding leaves of *Phaseolus vulgaris* L.: antioxidant enzyme response and nutrient element uptake. *Ecotoxicology and environmental safety* 73(6), 1304-1308.
- Carbonell- Barrachina, A., Burlo, F., Lopez, E. and Martínez- Sánchez, F. 1999. Arsenic toxicity and accumulation in radish as affected by arsenic chemical speciation. *Journal of Environmental Science & Health Part B*, 34(4), 661-679.
- Cheyns, K., Waegeneers, N., Van de Wiele, T. and Ruttens, A. 2017. Arsenic release from foodstuffs upon food preparation. *Journal of agricultural and food chemistry* 65(11), 2443-2453.
- Codex Alimentarius. 2016. General standard for contaminants and toxins in food and feed (Codex STAN 193-1995). URL: <http://dokipedia.ru/document/5197124.Rep>. *Phys* 66(3), 877-886.
- Cvjetko, P., Zovko, M. and Balen, B. 2014. Proteomika u istraživanjima toksičnosti teških metala u biljaka. *Arhiv za higijenu rada i toksikologiju*, 65(1), 1-17.

- Dghaim, R., Al Khatib, S., Rasool, H. and Ali Khan, M. 2015. Determination of heavy metals concentration in traditional herbs commonly consumed in the United Arab Emirates. *Journal of environmental and public health*, 2015.
- Deribachew, B., Amde, M. Nigussie-Dechassa, R. and Taddese, A. 2015. Selected heavy metals in some vegetables produced through wastewater irrigation and their toxicological implications in Eastern Ethiopia. *African Journal of Food, Agriculture, Nutrition and Development*, 15(3), 10013-10032.
- Dudka, S. and Miller, W. 1999. Accumulation of potentially toxic elements in plants and their transfer to human food chain. *Journal of Environmental Science & Health Part B* 34(4), 681-708.
- Elbagermi, M., Edwards, H. and Alajtal, A. 2012. Monitoring of heavy metal content in fruits and vegetables collected from production and market sites in the Misurata area of Libya. *International Scholarly Research Notices*, 2012, 1-5.
- Foulkes, M. E., Sadec, B. A., & Hill, S. J. 2020. Arsenic speciation and its DNA fractionation in the rice plant *Oryza sativa*. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 35(9), 1989-2001.
- Gajalakshmi, S., Iswarya, V., Ashwini, R., Divya, G., Mythili, S. and Sathiavelu, A. 2012. "Evaluation of heavy metals in medicinal plants growing in Vellore District." *European Journal of Experimental Biology* 2(5), 1457-1461.
- Gebreyohannes, F., and Gebrekidan, A. 2018. Health risk assessment of heavy metals via consumption of spinach vegetable grown in Elalla river, *Bulletin of the Chemical Society of Ethiopia*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 65-75.
- Gezahegn, W., Srinivasulu, A., Aruna, B., Banerjee, S., Sudarshan, M., Narayana, P. and Rao, A. 2017. Study of heavy metals accumulation in leafy vegetables of Ethiopia. *IOSR J. Environ Sci Toxicol Food Technol* 11(5), 57-68.
- Grytsyuk, N., Arapis, G., Pereplyatnikova, L. and Ivanova, T. 2006. Heavy metals effects on forage crops yields and estimation of elements accumulation in plants as affected by soil. *Science of the total environment*, 354(2-3), 224-231.
- Guerra, F., Trevizam, A., Muraoka, T., Marcante, N. and Canniatti-Brazaca, S. 2012. Heavy metals in vegetables and potential risk for human health. *Scientia Agricola*, 69, 54-60.
- Habib, M., Naser, Sultana, S., Mahmud, N. U., Gomes, R. and Noor, S. 2011. Heavy metal levels in vegetables with growth stage and plant species variations. *Bangladesh Journal of Agricultural Research* 36(4), 563-574.
- Haque, T., Tabassum, M., Jamilur Rahman, M., Siddique, M., Mostafa, M., Abdul Khalaque, M., Abedine, Z. and Hamidi, H. 2020. Environmental analysis of arsenic in water, soil and Food materials from highly contaminated area of Alampur Village, Amjhupi union, Meherpur. *Advanced Journal of Chemistry-Section A* 3(2), 181-191.
- Intawongse, M. and Dean, J. R. 2006. Uptake of heavy metals by vegetable plants grown on contaminated soil and their bioavailability in the human gastrointestinal tract. *Food additives and contaminants*, 23(1), 36-48.
- Jain, C. and Ali, I. 2000. Arsenic: occurrence, toxicity and speciation techniques. *Water research*, 34(17), 4304-4312.
- Jedynak, L., Kowalska, J., Harasimowicz, J. and Golimowski, J. 2009. Speciation analysis of arsenic in terrestrial plants from arsenic contaminated area. *Science of the total environment*, 407(2), 945-952.
- Jedynak, L., Kowalska, J., Kossykowska, M. and Golimowski, J. 2010. Studies on the uptake of different arsenic forms and the influence of sample pretreatment on arsenic speciation in White mustard (*Sinapis alba*). *Microchemical Journal*, 94(2), 125-129.
- Kabata-Pendias, A. 2011, *Trace Elements in Soils and Plants*. 4-th edition. Boca Raton, CRS Press. Science & Business Media.
- Kabata-Pendias, A. and Mukherjee, A. B. 2007, *Trace elements from soil to human*, Springer.
- Khan, A., Khan, S., Khan, M., Qamar, Z. and Waqas, M. 2015. The uptake and bioaccumulation of heavy metals by food plants, their effects on plants nutrients, and associated health risk: a review. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 22(18), 13772-13799.
- Khan, S., Ahmed, A., Yunus, M., Rahman, M., Hore, S., Vahter, M. and Wahed, M. 2010. Arsenic and cadmium in food-chain in Bangladesh—an exploratory study. *Journal of health, population and nutrition*, 28(6), 578.
- Latif, A., Bilal, M., Asghar, W., Azeem, M., Ahmad, M., Abbas, A., Ahmad, M. and Shahzad, T. 2018. Heavy metal accumulation in vegetables and assessment of their potential health risk. *Journal of Environmental Analytical Chemistry*, 5(1), 234.
- Liu, L. 2014. Heavy metals contamination in greenhouse soils and vegetables in Guanzhong, China. *Journal of Encapsulation and Adsorption Sciences* 4, 80-88.
- Likuku, A.S. and Obuseng, G. 2015. Health risk assessment of heavy metals via dietary intake of vegetables irrigated with treated wastewater around Gaborone, Botswana. *International Conference on Plant, Marine and Environmental Sciences*, 32-37.

- Mahdavi, E. S. 2009. Determination of Pb, Ni, Hg, Cr, Cd in edible vegetables in the west south of Tehran Province with atomic absorption. *Research Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 3(3), 339-344.
- Mustățea, G., Belc, N., Ungureanu, E., Lăcătușu, R., Petre, J. and Pruteanu, A. 2019. Heavy metals contamination of the soil–water–vegetables chain in the Ilfov region. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 112, 03030.
- Mohamed, A., Rashed, M. and Mofty, A. 2003. Assessment of essential and toxic elements in some kinds of vegetables. *Ecotoxicology and environmental safety*, 55(3), 251-260.
- Mohammadi, A.A., Zarei, A., Majidi, S., Ghaderpoury, A., Hashempour, Y., Saghi, M.H., Alinejad, A., Yousefi, M., Hosseingholizadeh, N. and Ghaderpoori, M. 2019. Carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic health risk assessment of heavy metals in drinking water of Khorramabad, Iran. *MethodsX*, 6, pp.1642-1651.
- Nan, Z., Zhao, C., Li, J., Chen, F. and Sun, W. 2002. Relations between soil properties and selected heavy metal concentrations in spring wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) grown in contaminated soils. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution*, 133(1), 205-213.
- Naghypour, D., Chenari, M., Taheri, N., Naghipour, F., Mehrabian, F., Attarchi, M., Jaafari, J. and Roubakhsh, E. 2018. The concentration data of heavy metals in vegetables of Guilan province, Iran. *Data in brief*, 21, 1704-1708.
- Parris, W. E. and Adeli, K. 2002. In vitro toxicological assessment of heavy metals and intracellular mechanisms of toxicity. *Heavy metals in the environment*. New York (NY): Marcel Dekker, pp. 69-93.
- Quartacci, M., Pinzino, C., Sgherri, C., Dalla Vecchia, F. and Navari- Izzo, F. 2000. Growth in excess copper induces changes in the lipid composition and fluidity of PSII- enriched membranes in wheat. *Physiologia Plantarum*, 108(1), 87-93.
- Rahman, I. and Hasan, M. 2007. Arsenic incorporation into garden vegetables irrigated with contaminated water. *Journal of Applied Sciences and Environmental Management*, 11(4), 105-112.
- Rai, P., Lee, S., Zhang, M., Tsang, Y. and Kim K-H. 2019. "Heavy metals in food crops: Health risks, fate, mechanisms, and management." *Environment international* 125: 365-385.
- Rusin, M., Domagalska, J., Rogala, D., Razzaghi, M. and Szymala, I. 2021. Concentration of cadmium and lead in vegetables and fruits. *Scientific Reports*, 11(1), 1-10.
- Samantaray, S., Rout, G. and Das, P. 1998. Role of chromium on plant growth and metabolism. *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum* 20(2), 201-212.
- Schutzendubel, A. and Polle, A. 2002. Plant responses to abiotic stresses: heavy metal- induced oxidative stress and protection by mycorrhization. *Journal of experimental botany*, 53(372), 1351-1365.
- Shaheen, N., Irfan, N., Khan, I., Islam, S., Islam, Md. S. and Ahmed Md. K. 2016. Presence of heavy metals in fruits and vegetables: health risk implications in Bangladesh. *Chemosphere* 152, 431-438.
- Signes-Pastor, A., Mitra, K., Sarkhel, S., Hobbes, M., Burló, F., De Groot, W. and Carbonell-Barrachina, A. 2008. Arsenic speciation in food and estimation of the dietary intake of inorganic arsenic in a rural village of West Bengal, India. *Journal of agricultural and food chemistry*, 56(20), 9469-9474.
- Smith, E., Juhasz, A. and Weber, J. 2009. Arsenic uptake and speciation in vegetables grown under greenhouse conditions. *Environmental Geochemistry and Health*, 31(1), 125-132.
- Souri, M., Alipanahi, N., Hatamian, M., Ahmadi, M. and Tesfamariam, T. 2018. Elemental profile of heavy metals in garden cress, coriander, lettuce and spinach, commonly cultivated in Kahrizak, South of Tehran-Iran. *Open agriculture*, 3(1), 32-37.
- Sultana, R., Chamon, A.S. and Mondol, M.N. 2021. Heavy metal concentration in commonly sold stem vegetables in Dhaka city market and probable health risk. *Dhaka University Journal of Biological Sciences*, 30(2), pp.221-232.
- Taghipour, H. and Mosaferi, M. 2013. Heavy metals in the vegetables collected from production sites. *Health promotion perspectives*, 3(2), 185-193.
- Tahar, K. and Keltoum, B. 2011. Effects of heavy metals pollution in soil and plant in the industrial area, West Algeria. *Journal of the Korean chemical society*, 55(6), 1018-1023.
- Valko, M., Morris, H. and Cronin, M. 2005. Metals, toxicity and oxidative stress. *Current medicinal chemistry* 12(10), 1161-1208.
- White P.J. 2012, "Ion uptake mechanisms of individual cells and roots: short-distance transport". In: Marschner, P, (ed). *Mineral nutrition of higher plants*. 3rd ed. London: Academic Press, pp. 7-48.
- Wilbur, S., Abadin, H., Fay, M., Yu, D., Tencza, B., Ingerman, L., Klotzbach, J. and James, S.,. 2012. Health effects, Toxicological profile for chromium. Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (US). (2012). "Health effects, Toxicological profile for chromium." Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (US), pp12.

- Xu, J., Yang, L., Wang, Z., Dong, G., Huang, J. and Wang, Y., J. 2006. Toxicity of copper on rice growth and accumulation of copper in rice grain in copper contaminated soil. *Chemosphere*, 62(4), 602-607.
- Zakaria, Z., Zulkafflee, N. S., Mohd Redzuan, N. A., Selamat, J., Ismail, M. R., Praveena, S. M., Tóth, G. & Abdull Razis, A. F. 2021. Understanding Potential Heavy Metal Contamination, Absorption, Translocation and Accumulation in Rice and Human Health Risks. *Plants*, 10(6), 1070.
- Živković, N., Takić, L., Djordjević, L., Djordjević, A., Mladenović-Ranisavljević, I., Golubović, T. and Božilov, A.. 2019. Concentrations of heavy metal cations and a health risk assessment of sediments and river surface water: a case study from a Serbian mine. *Pol. J. Environ. Stud*, 28(3), pp.2009-2020.
- Zokaei, M., Sepehri, M., Rezvani, M. and Zarei, A. 2018. Comparison of the concentration of heavy metals in some vegetables (celery, broccoli and lettuce). *Amazonia Investiga*, 7(16), 324-334.